



1
00:00:04,789 --> 00:00:03,190
over and so i'm wondering if you have

2
00:00:06,230 --> 00:00:04,799
ever heard of something like that or

3
00:00:07,590 --> 00:00:06,240
seen anything like that and if it would

4
00:00:10,150 --> 00:00:07,600
show up in the

5
00:00:12,150 --> 00:00:10,160
um mri imaging

6
00:00:14,230 --> 00:00:12,160
yes as a matter of fact one of the

7
00:00:17,109 --> 00:00:14,240
experiments we we usually do to test the

8
00:00:19,830 --> 00:00:17,119
scanner is a finger tapping experiment

9
00:00:22,470 --> 00:00:19,840
and when we do finger tapping on off we

10
00:00:25,189 --> 00:00:22,480
get activation and a lot of times we'll

11
00:00:26,950 --> 00:00:25,199
we'll get bilateral activation but it

12
00:00:30,070 --> 00:00:26,960
will be stronger

13
00:00:31,910 --> 00:00:30,080

on the contralateral hemisphere

14

00:00:34,630 --> 00:00:31,920

but i can understand that there could be

15

00:00:36,389 --> 00:00:34,640

some people that have homolateral

16

00:00:39,990 --> 00:00:36,399

activation

17

00:00:42,150 --> 00:00:40,000

but the usual case the usual brain

18

00:00:43,990 --> 00:00:42,160

is for contralateral activation if you

19

00:00:46,630 --> 00:00:44,000

do your right hand you usually get

20

00:00:48,869 --> 00:00:46,640

left-sided activation that's the usual

21

00:00:49,910 --> 00:00:48,879

case

22

00:00:53,029 --> 00:00:49,920

todd

23

00:00:57,670 --> 00:00:54,790

think that the

24

00:01:00,310 --> 00:00:57,680

setup of your eeg experiment where you

25

00:01:02,950 --> 00:01:00,320

had all your monitoring equipment

26

00:01:05,270 --> 00:01:02,960

directly in line in between the sender

27

00:01:07,429 --> 00:01:05,280

and receiver may have

28

00:01:09,030 --> 00:01:07,439

not given you such good results as if

29

00:01:10,710 --> 00:01:09,040

they'd have been separate in a different

30

00:01:12,310 --> 00:01:10,720

way

31

00:01:14,710 --> 00:01:12,320

yeah are you asking because they're in

32

00:01:15,670 --> 00:01:14,720

line or yeah right nick you're you know

33

00:01:17,030 --> 00:01:15,680

you're

34

00:01:18,710 --> 00:01:17,040

the center and the receiver are on the

35

00:01:21,749 --> 00:01:18,720

same straight line as

36

00:01:23,910 --> 00:01:21,759

as your electronic monitoring equipment

37

00:01:25,670 --> 00:01:23,920

right is that is that true uh that was

38

00:01:26,789 --> 00:01:25,680

pretty much true they were three rooms

39

00:01:31,749 --> 00:01:26,799

in a row

40

00:01:33,030 --> 00:01:31,759

but there was quite a big distance

41

00:01:35,190 --> 00:01:33,040

between

42

00:01:37,109 --> 00:01:35,200

the the so that in that diagram they

43

00:01:38,710 --> 00:01:37,119

looked close together but there was

44

00:01:41,270 --> 00:01:38,720

quite a big distance those were pretty

45

00:01:53,749 --> 00:01:41,280

big rooms that there were in between

46

00:01:59,510 --> 00:01:55,830

i wonder if you might have any uh

47

00:02:02,870 --> 00:01:59,520

speculation or explanation perhaps why

48

00:02:03,910 --> 00:02:02,880

uh i believe the hawaiian situation was

49

00:02:06,389 --> 00:02:03,920

healers

50

00:02:08,869 --> 00:02:06,399

why there would be a strong response or

51
00:02:10,150 --> 00:02:08,879
noticeable response in the deep in the

52
00:02:11,110 --> 00:02:10,160
optical

53
00:02:12,630 --> 00:02:11,120
region

54
00:02:14,229 --> 00:02:12,640
of the brain

55
00:02:15,910 --> 00:02:14,239
so that's a good question why in the

56
00:02:18,309 --> 00:02:15,920
optical region

57
00:02:20,470 --> 00:02:18,319
one of my explanations is that there's

58
00:02:23,430 --> 00:02:20,480
some imagery involved

59
00:02:26,949 --> 00:02:23,440
so so maybe what's happening is that the

60
00:02:28,869 --> 00:02:26,959
healers are invoking an imagery process

61
00:02:31,270 --> 00:02:28,879
in the receiver

62
00:02:34,710 --> 00:02:31,280
so so the the truth is

63
00:02:35,509 --> 00:02:34,720

in normal visual experiments if a human

64

00:02:37,670 --> 00:02:35,519

will

65

00:02:40,710 --> 00:02:37,680

picture an event

66

00:02:43,110 --> 00:02:40,720

and just make an image in his mind the

67

00:02:44,470 --> 00:02:43,120

brain activates as if he's really seen

68

00:02:47,350 --> 00:02:44,480

the picture

69

00:02:49,670 --> 00:02:47,360

so so it's a very close coupling in the

70

00:02:52,390 --> 00:02:49,680

brain between reality

71

00:02:54,150 --> 00:02:52,400

and just thinking about a picture so if

72

00:02:57,830 --> 00:02:54,160

you think of a face

73

00:02:59,270 --> 00:02:57,840

you'll activate

74

00:03:01,589 --> 00:02:59,280

the fusiform

75

00:03:03,110 --> 00:03:01,599

as if you were really looking at a face

76
00:03:05,750 --> 00:03:03,120
even though you're just thinking about a

77
00:03:07,270 --> 00:03:05,760
face so i think it's the imagery that's

78
00:03:13,589 --> 00:03:07,280
being evoked

79
00:03:16,830 --> 00:03:14,869
i'm curious

80
00:03:19,990 --> 00:03:16,840
how the sender

81
00:03:21,670 --> 00:03:20,000
identifies the receiver

82
00:03:23,830 --> 00:03:21,680
not just in your talk but in previous

83
00:03:25,509 --> 00:03:23,840
ones as well but

84
00:03:28,149 --> 00:03:25,519
in some cases clearly you have them

85
00:03:29,910 --> 00:03:28,159
connected by circuitry in other cases

86
00:03:31,830 --> 00:03:29,920
they're in separate rooms

87
00:03:33,990 --> 00:03:31,840
so i could imagine the sender would know

88
00:03:36,070 --> 00:03:34,000

the person's name perhaps it would know

89

00:03:38,550 --> 00:03:36,080

the location might be thinking

90

00:03:41,110 --> 00:03:38,560

geospatially as to all person located

91

00:03:42,630 --> 00:03:41,120

there or might be thinking oh fred what

92

00:03:45,910 --> 00:03:42,640

what is the sender

93

00:03:47,750 --> 00:03:45,920

doing mentally to identify the receiver

94

00:03:50,470 --> 00:03:47,760

well that's a good question before they

95

00:03:52,630 --> 00:03:50,480

started the experiment we had

96

00:03:53,670 --> 00:03:52,640

the healer spend some time with the

97

00:03:55,589 --> 00:03:53,680

sender

98

00:03:57,589 --> 00:03:55,599

so they they they were in

99

00:03:59,429 --> 00:03:57,599

they spent some time together

100

00:04:01,990 --> 00:03:59,439

you know getting to know each other and

101
00:04:04,630 --> 00:04:02,000
so that so that the sender really did

102
00:04:06,869 --> 00:04:04,640
have a good impression about who the

103
00:04:09,830 --> 00:04:06,879
sender the receiver was

104
00:04:11,910 --> 00:04:09,840
so they did spend some time together

105
00:04:14,630 --> 00:04:11,920
before they separated

106
00:04:16,550 --> 00:04:14,640
but we've done it both ways if the

107
00:04:19,909 --> 00:04:16,560
sender doesn't know

108
00:04:22,310 --> 00:04:19,919
the receiver it it doesn't work as well

109
00:04:23,749 --> 00:04:22,320
it it almost doesn't work

110
00:04:26,629 --> 00:04:23,759
nearly as well

111
00:04:28,870 --> 00:04:26,639
as when the send the sender knows pretty

112
00:04:34,790 --> 00:04:28,880
well the receiver does that answer your

113
00:04:40,310 --> 00:04:37,670

sorry i uh

114

00:04:42,550 --> 00:04:40,320

i'm having a bit of deja vu here and

115

00:04:45,510 --> 00:04:42,560

wishing i could get at my reference

116

00:04:47,830 --> 00:04:45,520

library because i seem to remember but

117

00:04:51,830 --> 00:04:47,840

i'm blocking on details that quite

118

00:04:53,430 --> 00:04:51,840

recently there's been another fmri study

119

00:04:55,350 --> 00:04:53,440

that

120

00:04:58,550 --> 00:04:55,360

garnered some publicity for claiming to

121

00:05:01,270 --> 00:04:58,560

have refuted the whole esp concept once

122

00:05:03,830 --> 00:05:01,280

and for all and showing no correlation

123

00:05:07,110 --> 00:05:03,840

between senders and and receivers in an

124

00:05:08,310 --> 00:05:07,120

esp task really um do you know who the

125

00:05:10,629 --> 00:05:08,320

author was

126

00:05:13,590 --> 00:05:10,639

that's why i wish i could get at my

127

00:05:14,629 --> 00:05:13,600

library to check

128

00:05:17,189 --> 00:05:14,639

oh really

129

00:05:20,550 --> 00:05:17,199

well i could i can picture in

130

00:05:23,189 --> 00:05:20,560

an environment when nothing would work

131

00:05:26,150 --> 00:05:23,199

you can sabotage the environment

132

00:05:27,749 --> 00:05:26,160

and make it so nothing works

133

00:05:29,590 --> 00:05:27,759

i mean several people here have

134

00:05:30,629 --> 00:05:29,600

mentioned that the environment is very

135

00:05:33,270 --> 00:05:30,639

important

136

00:05:36,390 --> 00:05:33,280

in how you set up the experiment

137

00:05:39,430 --> 00:05:36,400

and so i think that the environmental

138

00:05:43,990 --> 00:05:39,440

impact can influence how well

139

00:05:46,790 --> 00:05:46,070

so i i can understand how there could be

140

00:05:50,230 --> 00:05:46,800

a

141

00:05:51,990 --> 00:05:50,240

result

142

00:05:54,710 --> 00:05:52,000

i'm curious in what way were the alpha

143

00:05:56,870 --> 00:05:54,720

waves linked do they have the same

144

00:05:59,110 --> 00:05:56,880

frequency were they

145

00:06:01,670 --> 00:05:59,120

synchronized or how how did that work

146

00:06:03,830 --> 00:06:01,680

the alpha ways were linked in the way

147

00:06:06,790 --> 00:06:03,840

that they differed between the flicker

148

00:06:09,830 --> 00:06:06,800

on state and the flicker off state

149

00:06:11,670 --> 00:06:09,840

so we were comparing the alpha

150

00:06:13,749 --> 00:06:11,680

amplitude between

151
00:06:15,189 --> 00:06:13,759
on and off

152
00:06:17,110 --> 00:06:15,199
and and that

153
00:06:18,950 --> 00:06:17,120
distance and that difference

154
00:06:22,629 --> 00:06:18,960
between those two states is what we used

155
00:06:30,550 --> 00:06:23,670
amplitude

156
00:06:35,350 --> 00:06:33,350
um i had a question about the receivers

157
00:06:36,950 --> 00:06:35,360
i mean who were they

158
00:06:39,270 --> 00:06:36,960
what were they told did they have a

159
00:06:41,430 --> 00:06:39,280
background of meditation or they were

160
00:06:43,110 --> 00:06:41,440
they involved with the healers or were

161
00:06:45,110 --> 00:06:43,120
they just some people off the street

162
00:06:48,230 --> 00:06:45,120
that were that they grabbed

163
00:06:50,309 --> 00:06:48,240

the receivers the receivers yeah the the

164

00:06:52,790 --> 00:06:50,319

receivers were chosen

165

00:06:55,270 --> 00:06:52,800

as far as i know by the healer but but i

166

00:06:57,830 --> 00:06:55,280

i'd have to ask genie that that question

167

00:06:59,990 --> 00:06:57,840

i i'm i'm not entirely sure sure how

168

00:07:02,550 --> 00:07:00,000

they were chosen but i do know that they

169

00:07:05,029 --> 00:07:02,560

they did spend time with the healer

170

00:07:07,749 --> 00:07:05,039

before they went in the scanner so so

171

00:07:10,150 --> 00:07:07,759

that the healer did have a really good

172

00:07:11,830 --> 00:07:10,160

uh relationship with them before they

173

00:07:13,830 --> 00:07:11,840

went into the scanner

174

00:07:15,430 --> 00:07:13,840

and imaging than a sort of part of this

175

00:07:18,390 --> 00:07:15,440

healer's idea so they could be

176

00:07:20,309 --> 00:07:18,400

transmitted to the receiver if they talk

177

00:07:22,390 --> 00:07:20,319

to each other

178

00:07:24,790 --> 00:07:22,400

what's your question well if the healers

179

00:07:26,870 --> 00:07:24,800

are into imaging

180

00:07:28,469 --> 00:07:26,880

then if they discuss talked it over with

181

00:07:30,950 --> 00:07:28,479

the receivers then

182

00:07:31,749 --> 00:07:30,960

that may help explain why it's

183

00:07:36,309 --> 00:07:31,759

uh

184

00:07:40,550 --> 00:07:36,319

of the brain oh i see what you mean i i

185

00:07:40,560 --> 00:07:44,309

okay

186

00:07:44,319 --> 00:07:51,990

because it's it's

187

00:07:54,869 --> 00:07:53,670

todd that was a great presentation thank

188

00:07:56,390 --> 00:07:54,879

you thank you

189

00:07:58,230 --> 00:07:56,400

i happen to have talked to jeannie

190

00:08:01,350 --> 00:07:58,240

ochterberg about

191

00:08:03,589 --> 00:08:01,360

how those subjects were chosen and she

192

00:08:06,550 --> 00:08:03,599

says that

193

00:08:08,710 --> 00:08:06,560

the healers were asked to recruit a

194

00:08:10,469 --> 00:08:08,720

subject with whom they had worked in the

195

00:08:13,029 --> 00:08:10,479

past

196

00:08:14,309 --> 00:08:13,039

and had some sort of empathic emotional

197

00:08:16,790 --> 00:08:14,319

connection

198

00:08:19,350 --> 00:08:16,800

uh and so the empathic

199

00:08:21,350 --> 00:08:19,360

component to the whole deal

200

00:08:22,790 --> 00:08:21,360

seems to be really crucial about what

201
00:08:25,430 --> 00:08:22,800
you found

202
00:08:27,830 --> 00:08:25,440
and it seems to me that uh these

203
00:08:30,629 --> 00:08:27,840
large-scale double-blind healing studies

204
00:08:32,630 --> 00:08:30,639
where you have typically strangers

205
00:08:35,269 --> 00:08:32,640
praying for strangers

206
00:08:36,709 --> 00:08:35,279
completely subvert

207
00:08:39,670 --> 00:08:36,719
one of the

208
00:08:40,469 --> 00:08:39,680
necessary factors at least uh in your

209
00:08:44,470 --> 00:08:40,479
study

210
00:08:47,430 --> 00:08:44,480
right uh so

211
00:08:49,509 --> 00:08:47,440
it that's probably uh

212
00:08:51,110 --> 00:08:49,519
a great shortcoming of the double-blind

213
00:08:54,389 --> 00:08:51,120

randomized uh

214

00:08:56,310 --> 00:08:54,399

study as it's done in in in many places

215

00:08:58,389 --> 00:08:56,320

right that's so important for the healer

216

00:09:01,430 --> 00:08:58,399

and the receiver to to have a good

217

00:09:03,110 --> 00:09:01,440

relationship and empathic emotional type

218

00:09:05,509 --> 00:09:03,120

of connection

219

00:09:07,590 --> 00:09:05,519

and uh in the follow-up study that you

220

00:09:09,750 --> 00:09:07,600

all did i understand that that empathic

221

00:09:12,310 --> 00:09:09,760

bond simply wasn't there

222

00:09:14,630 --> 00:09:12,320

because these uh in the rerun of the

223

00:09:15,829 --> 00:09:14,640

study the healers did not know

224

00:09:19,430 --> 00:09:15,839

the uh

225

00:09:21,030 --> 00:09:19,440

there was one where genie did one where

226

00:09:23,110 --> 00:09:21,040

they didn't know each other is that

227

00:09:25,670 --> 00:09:23,120

right yeah and that that showed no

228

00:09:28,150 --> 00:09:25,680

significance it was a flop it was a flop

229

00:09:30,790 --> 00:09:28,160

so so that makes sense to me why this

230

00:09:32,550 --> 00:09:30,800

other person got a negative result when

231

00:09:34,949 --> 00:09:32,560

if they didn't set it up a good

232

00:09:37,670 --> 00:09:34,959

connection between the healer and the

233

00:09:39,269 --> 00:09:37,680

receiver that's so crucial

234

00:09:41,430 --> 00:09:39,279

and and i know you do that with your

235

00:09:43,750 --> 00:09:41,440

work too right you you make you

236

00:09:45,990 --> 00:09:43,760

establish a good connection

237

00:09:46,949 --> 00:09:46,000

right in your work

238

00:09:49,590 --> 00:09:46,959

yeah

239

00:09:51,190 --> 00:09:49,600

could you talk about the control

240

00:09:54,310 --> 00:09:51,200

aspects of this

241

00:09:57,990 --> 00:09:54,320

on the first experiment